

**The application of structural
contingency theory to supply chain
management – developing a strategic
model for prefabricated timber
systems**

Matthew Ian Holmes

**A thesis submitted in fulfillment of the requirement for the
degree of Doctor of Philosophy**

University of Technology Sydney, Australia

2013

Certificate of authorship/originality

I certify that the work in this thesis has not previously been submitted for a degree nor has it been submitted as part of requirements for a degree except as fully acknowledged within the text.

I also certify that the thesis has been written by me. Any help that I have received in my research work and the preparation of the thesis itself has been acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

Signature of Student:

Date:

Acknowledgements

First and foremost I would like to thank my supervisors, Dr Grace Ding and Professor Keith Crews, for their time and support for my work. Their ongoing assistance and feedback throughout this research made completion of this thesis possible. Grace in particular went above and beyond the call of duty and I am extremely grateful. I would also like to thank Professor Goran Runeson for his valued feedback and input on my thesis. I would also like to pay homage to Peter Moore for the arduous task of editing the thesis in its entirety.

I would also like to thank my family and friends for their ongoing support - in particular my parents for their patience and support whilst completing this research, I would not have been able to do it without them! I would also like to thank my colleagues at university, in particular Doug Thomas and Dr Michael Er for their on-going discussions and freely giving up their time to review my work. Also a thank you to Tobias Smith for designing the virtual case study building used to test the supply chain model in this thesis.

Last but not least I would like to thank all the industry practitioners who freely contributed their time for this research. They have made this research possible and without their contributions and insight a lot of the data for this research would not have been able to be collected.

Table of Contents

LIST OF FIGURES	VIII
LIST OF TABLES	IX
LIST OF PUBLICATIONS DURING CANDIDATURE	X
ABSTRACT	XI
CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 BACKGROUND	1
1.2 PROBLEM DEFINITION	2
1.3 THE APPLICATION OF STRUCTURAL CONTINGENCY THEORY TO SUPPLY CHAIN MANAGEMENT OF PREFABRICATED TIMBER SYSTEMS	4
1.4 MOTIVATION FOR UNDERTAKING RESEARCH	5
1.5 THE RESEARCH AIMS AND OBJECTIVES	5
1.6 RESEARCH SCOPE AND FOCUS	7
1.7 RESEARCH METHOD	8
1.8 OUTLINE OF THESIS	10
CHAPTER 2 STRUCTURAL CONTINGENCY THEORY & SUPPLY CHAIN MANAGEMENT	13
2.1 INTRODUCTION	13
2.2 ORGANISATIONAL THEORIES – BACKGROUND	13
2.2.1 <i>Classical management & human orientated schools</i>	15
2.2.2 <i>Decision theory & system orientated schools</i>	16
2.3 CONTINGENCY MANAGEMENT SCHOOL	18
2.3.1 <i>Size as a contingency</i>	19
2.3.2 <i>Strategy as a contingency</i>	20
2.3.3 <i>Environment as a contingency</i>	21
2.4 STRUCTURAL CONTINGENCY THEORY	22
2.4.1 <i>Limitations and application to other disciplines</i>	24
2.5 APPLICATIONS OF STRUCTURAL CONTINGENCY THEORY TO SUPPLY CHAIN MANAGEMENT	24
2.6 CONCLUSION	26
CHAPTER 3 SUPPLY CHAIN MANAGEMENT & ENGINEERED-TO-ORDER PRODUCTS	27
3.1 INTRODUCTION	27
3.2 BACKGROUND AND KEY THEMES IN SCM	28
3.2.1 <i>Distribution</i>	29
3.2.2 <i>Production</i>	31
3.2.3 <i>Strategic Procurement</i>	33
3.2.4 <i>Industrial organisational economics</i>	35
3.3 STRATEGIC PROCUREMENT MANAGEMENT	37
3.3.1 <i>Partnering & Strategic Alliances</i>	39
3.3.2 <i>Vertical Integration (VI)</i>	42
3.4 PRODUCT TYPOLOGY AND THE SUPPLY CHAIN AND ENGINEERED TO ORDER (ETO)	43
3.4.1 <i>SCM Strategies for ETO supply chains</i>	46
3.5 ETO COMPANY AND SUPPLY CHAIN MODELS	48
3.5.1 <i>ETO company models</i>	49
3.5.2 <i>ETO supply chain models (multiple companies)</i>	51
3.5.3 <i>Selection of ETO models</i>	53
3.6 CONCLUSION	54

CHAPTER 4 PREFABRICATED TIMBER SYSTEMS	56
4.1 INTRODUCTION	56
4.2 AN OVERVIEW OF ENGINEERED WOOD PRODUCTS – PREFABRICATED TIMBER SYSTEMS	57
4.2.1 <i>Glulam</i>	59
4.2.2 <i>Cross Laminated Timber (CLT)</i>	60
4.2.3 <i>Laminated Veneer Lumber (LVL)</i>	61
4.2.4 <i>EXPAN</i>	62
4.3 TIMBER AND ENGINEERED TIMBER USE IN THE CONSTRUCTION INDUSTRY	64
4.3.1 <i>Residential construction in Australia</i>	64
4.3.2 <i>Non-residential construction in Australia</i>	66
4.3.3 <i>Potential market size for prefabricated structural systems in non-residential construction</i>	67
4.4 OPPORTUNITIES AND BENEFITS OF USING PREFABRICATED TIMBER CONSTRUCTION IN NON-RESIDENTIAL CONSTRUCTION	68
4.5 KEY ISSUES LIMITING PREFABRICATED TIMBER SYSTEMS IN NON-RESIDENTIAL BUILDINGS	70
4.5.1 <i>Codes - Building Regulations</i>	70
4.5.2 <i>Difficult to design</i>	74
4.5.3 <i>Costs</i>	75
4.5.4 <i>Performance issues</i>	78
4.5.5 <i>Lack of skilled fabricators</i>	78
4.5.6 <i>Environmental issues</i>	79
4.6 RECOMMENDATIONS AND INITIATIVES OUTLINED IN LITERATURE	80
4.7 RAW MATERIAL ACQUISITION (FORESTRY/LOG SUPPLY)	82
4.8 CONCLUSION	84
CHAPTER 5 RESEARCH METHOD	86
5.1 INTRODUCTION	86
5.2 RESEARCH METHOD	87
5.3 QUALITATIVE VS. QUANTITATIVE RESEARCH	89
5.4 CASE STUDIES - PREFABRICATED TIMBER SUPPLY CHAINS IN AUSTRALIA/NZ AND EUROPE	91
5.4.1 <i>Research Design</i>	91
5.4.2 <i>Data collection method</i>	92
5.4.3 <i>Sampling</i>	95
5.4.4 <i>Selection of interviewees</i>	96
5.4.5 <i>Data Analysis</i>	97
5.5 CASE STUDIES – PREFABRICATED TIMBER SYSTEMS USED IN NON-RESIDENTIAL BUILDINGS IN AUSTRALIA AND NZ (BUILDING AND TESTING PROJECTS)	98
5.5.1 <i>Research design</i>	98
5.5.2 <i>Selection of building case studies</i>	100
5.5.3 <i>Data Collection</i>	101
5.5.4 <i>Data Analysis</i>	102
5.5.5 <i>Hypothesis/theory testing using case studies</i>	104
5.6 CONCLUSION	107
CHAPTER 6 DATA COLLECTION & ANALYSIS – PART ONE CASE STUDY RESULTS	109
6.1 INTRODUCTION	109
6.2 ROUND 1 CASE STUDY	110
6.2.1 <i>Australia/NZ</i>	110
6.2.2 <i>Europe</i>	118
6.2.3 <i>Cross Case analysis of Round 1 data</i>	123
6.3 ROUND 2 CASE STUDY	125
6.3.1 <i>Australia/NZ</i>	126
6.3.2 <i>Europe</i>	131
6.3.3 <i>Cross Case Analysis of Round 2 data</i>	135

6.4 CONCLUSION	137
CHAPTER 7 MODEL DEVELOPMENT	140
7.1 INTRODUCTION	140
7.2 STRUCTURAL CONTINGENCY THEORY AND PREFABRICATED TIMBER SYSTEMS	141
7.3 NON-RESIDENTIAL MARKET NEEDS AND EXPECTATIONS	144
7.4 PORTER'S FIVE FORCES ANALYSIS	147
7.4.1 <i>Bargaining power of suppliers</i>	149
7.4.2 <i>Bargaining power of buyers</i>	150
7.4.3 <i>Threat of new entrants</i>	150
7.4.4 <i>Threat of substitute products or services</i>	151
7.4.5 <i>Competitive rivalry among existing competitors</i>	151
7.5 MODEL DEVELOPMENT CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK	152
7.5.1 <i>Framework steps in detail</i>	153
7.5.2 <i>Review of current supply chain</i>	156
7.6 MODEL DEVELOPMENT	158
7.6.1 <i>First step – define supply chain model purpose</i>	158
7.6.2 <i>Second step – supply chain performance measures</i>	159
7.6.3 <i>Third step – determine product type</i>	159
7.6.4 <i>Fourth step – define supply chain configuration</i>	160
7.6.5 <i>Fifth step – characterise supply chain model elements</i>	165
7.7 CONCLUSION	166
CHAPTER 8 BUILDING CASE STUDIES & THEORY TESTING	168
8.1 INTRODUCTION	168
8.2 CASE STUDY 1 - UNIVERSITY OF TECHNOLOGY (UTS) FLOOR SYSTEMS, SYDNEY, AUSTRALIA	169
8.2.1 <i>Introduction</i>	169
8.2.2 <i>Key issues affecting performance (time, cost and quality)</i>	172
8.2.3 <i>Case study analysis and theory testing</i>	178
8.2.4 <i>Conclusion</i>	181
8.3 CASE STUDY 2 STIC OFFICE, CHRISTCHURCH, NZ	182
8.3.1 <i>Introduction</i>	182
8.3.2 <i>Key issues affecting performance (time, cost and quality)</i>	184
8.3.3 <i>Case study analysis & theory testing</i>	193
8.3.4 <i>Conclusion</i>	196
8.4 CASE STUDY 3 - NELSON MARLBOROUGH INSTITUTE OF TECHNOLOGY (NMIT) ARTS & MEDIA CENTRE NELSON, NZ	196
8.4.1 <i>Introduction</i>	196
8.4.2 <i>Key issues affecting performance (time, cost and quality)</i>	199
8.4.3 <i>Case study analysis & theory testing</i>	206
8.4.4 <i>Conclusion</i>	208
8.5 CONCLUSION	209
CHAPTER 9 MODEL VALIDATION	211
9.1 INTRODUCTION	211
9.2 HOW THE SBE MODEL CAN IMPROVE TIME, COST AND QUALITY ALONG THE SUPPLY CHAIN OF PREFABRICATED TIMBER SYSTEMS	211
9.2.1 <i>Cross case analysis of key supply chain issues in part one case studies (interviews) and part two case studies (prefabricated timber systems in buildings) in Australia/NZ</i>	211
9.2.2 <i>Modifications to the SBE model to incorporate findings from part two building case studies</i>	215
9.2.3 <i>How the SBE model can improve cost, time and quality</i>	218
9.3 CONCLUSION	225

CHAPTER 10	SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS	226
10.1	INTRODUCTION	226
10.2	SUMMARY OF RESEARCH	226
10.3	REVIEW OF AIMS AND OBJECTIVES	228
10.3.1	<i>Investigating ‘how’ and ‘why’ the supply chain impacts on the performance of prefabricated timber systems</i>	229
10.3.2	<i>Examining ‘how’ and ‘why’ the structure of organisations along the supply chain impact on performance of prefabricated timber systems</i>	230
10.3.3	<i>Applying the concept of supply chain management to investigate issues of the supply chain for prefabricated timber systems</i>	231
10.3.4	<i>Developing a supply chain model – the SBE model</i>	231
10.3.5	<i>Verifying and testing of supply chain model</i>	232
10.4	LIMITATIONS WITH RESEARCH & SBE MODEL	233
10.5	RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FURTHER RESEARCH	234
10.5.1	<i>Undertake further building case studies to determine issues along the supply chain that affect time, cost and quality</i>	235
10.5.2	<i>Undertake further analysis on completed buildings in Europe using prefabricated timber systems</i>	236
10.5.3	<i>Obtaining feedback from companies along the supply chain on their interest to be involved & implement the SBE model</i>	236
10.5.4	<i>Implementing and testing the SBE model on real building cases</i>	237
10.5.5	<i>Re-testing structural contingency theory on building case studies that have used the SBE model</i>	238
10.5.6	<i>Implement & test the SBE model on other ETO products</i>	238
10.5.7	<i>Compare time, cost and quality of completed timber buildings with steel and concrete alternatives</i>	239
10.6	CONCLUSIONS	240
REFERENCES		241
APPENDICES		252
APPENDIX A	INTERVIEW CONSENT AUTHORITY FORM	252
APPENDIX B	NVIVO 9 NODE REPORT	253
APPENDIX C	INTERVIEW TRANSCRIPT EXAMPLE – R1 AUSTRALIA/NZ	255
APPENDIX D	EXAMPLE OF SEMI-STRUCTURED INTERVIEW QUESTIONS R1 AUSTRALIA/NZ	269
APPENDIX E	EXAMPLE OF SEMI-STRUCTURED INTERVIEW QUESTIONS R2 AUSTRALIA/NZ	271
APPENDIX F	VIRTUAL BUILDING CASE STUDY USED TO TEST SBE MODEL	274

List of Figures

Figure 1.1 Prefabricated timber system supply chain and scope of research	8
Figure 2.1 Porter's value chain	14
Figure 2.2 Progression of management & organisation theories & schools	15
Figure 3.1 Six supply chain structures and processes involved	44
Figure 4.1 Australia Softwood Timber Harvest Forecast 2010 - 2049	83
Figure 4.2 New Zealand Softwood Timber Harvest Forecast 2012-2040	83
Figure 5.1 The basic pattern-matching model	104
Figure 5.2 Seven steps to testing theories from case studies	105
Figure 6.1 Supply for MTS prefabricated timber products used in residential market	113
Figure 6.2 Supply for ETO prefabricated timber products used in non-residential market	114
Figure 7.1 The Five Forces That Shape Industry Competition	149
Figure 7.2 Conceptual framework	153
Figure 7.3 Current supply chain for EXPAN products in Australia/NZ	157
Figure 7.4 Supply chain model for prefabricated timber systems in Australia and NZ	163
Figure 8.1 Completed prefabricated floor systems	170
Figure 8.2 Supply chain for prefabricated timber elements on project	172
Figure 8.3 UTS test floors break up – Expressed as percentage (%) of total cost	176
Figure 8.4 Theory testing from case studies	178
Figure 8.5 STIC office during construction	182
Figure 8.6 STIC office in University of Canterbury test laboratory	183
Figure 8.7 Supply chain for prefabricated timber elements on the project	183
Figure 8.8 Temporary plywood gussets (non-engineered)	185
Figure 8.9 Installing frames onto steel rods on concrete plinths	186
Figure 8.10 Breakup of STIC Office as a percentage of total costs	189
Figure 8.11 Percentages of Labour and Material Costs for STIC Test Building	191
Figure 8.12 Theory testing from case studies	193
Figure 8.13 NMIT project – prefabricated timber structural system installation	198
Figure 8.14 Supply chain for prefabricated timber elements on NMIT	199
Figure 8.15 Theory testing from case studies	206
Figure 9.1 Updated SBE model	218
Figure 9.2 Case study building - timber structural system	219
Figure 9.3 Case study supply chain route to project site	220
Figure 9.4 Fabricated wood manufacturing in Australia cost structure	222

List of Tables

<i>Table 3-1 Benefits of partnering</i>	<i>41</i>
<i>Table 3-2 Characteristics of production management in the product taxonomy</i>	<i>45</i>
<i>Table 4-1 Residential construction market in Australia</i>	<i>65</i>
<i>Table 4-2 New housing starts in Australia (2006 – 2012)</i>	<i>65</i>
<i>Table 4-3 Non-residential construction market in Australia.....</i>	<i>67</i>
<i>Table 4-4 Structural costs as a % of overall structural costs</i>	<i>68</i>
<i>Table 4-5 LCA results from studies comparing timber (LVL), concrete and steel buildings.....</i>	<i>69</i>
<i>Table 4-6 BCA Alternate Solutions for case study buildings.....</i>	<i>71</i>
<i>Table 4-7 Construction costs associated with different multi-storey building types in NZ.....</i>	<i>76</i>
<i>Table 5-1 Relevant Situations for Different Research Strategies.....</i>	<i>88</i>
<i>Table 6-1 Round 1 Interviewee details – Australia/NZ</i>	<i>111</i>
<i>Table 6-2 Key theme affecting performance of prefabricated timber systems.....</i>	<i>112</i>
<i>Table 6-3 Round 1 Interviewee details – Europe.....</i>	<i>119</i>
<i>Table 6-4 Key theme affecting performance of prefabricated timber systems.....</i>	<i>120</i>
<i>Table 6-5 Key issues affecting time, cost and quality of prefabricated timber systems.....</i>	<i>123</i>
<i>Table 6-6 Round 2 Interviewee details – Australia/NZ</i>	<i>126</i>
<i>Table 6-7 Services offered/business models of timber companies in Australia & NZ</i>	<i>128</i>
<i>Table 6-8 Round 2 Interviewee details – Australia/NZ</i>	<i>131</i>
<i>Table 6-9 Services offered/business models of timber companies in Europe.....</i>	<i>132</i>
<i>Table 7-1 Manufacturers and fabricators of prefabricated timber systems in Australia and NZ....</i>	<i>143</i>
<i>Table 7-2 Different technologies – suggested model boundaries and processes.....</i>	<i>154</i>
<i>Table 7-3 Supply chain performance measures (metrics) associated with model goals.....</i>	<i>159</i>
<i>Table 8-1 Interviewee details UTS floors.....</i>	<i>170</i>
<i>Table 8-2 Total costs of the UTS floor systems</i>	<i>175</i>
<i>Table 8-3 Actual Cost of STIC Office building.....</i>	<i>188</i>
<i>Table 8-4 Cost Breakdown of elements in STIC Test building (\$NZD).....</i>	<i>190</i>
<i>Table 8-5 Interviewee details from NMIT project.....</i>	<i>197</i>
<i>Table 8-6 Time for key prefabricated timber structural systems on the NMIT project.....</i>	<i>200</i>
<i>Table 9-1 Cross-case analysis of issues in part one and part two case studies</i>	<i>212</i>
<i>Table 9-2 Case study building cost comparison, traditional supply chain vs SBE model.....</i>	<i>221</i>
<i>Table 9-3 Shipping costs NZ (Marsden Point) to Australia (Sydney/ Melbourne)</i>	<i>223</i>

List of publications during candidature

Conference papers

- Holmes, M., Crews, K. & Ding, G. 2011, 'The influence building codes and fire regulations have on multi-storey timber construction in Australia ', paper presented to the *World Sustainable Building Conference* Helsinki, Finland
- Holmes, M., Crews, K. & Ding, G. 2012, 'Supply Chain Management Strategies for Engineered-to-Order timber structural systems'. Paper presented to the RIC COBRA Conference, Las Vegas, Nevada, USA

Industry presentations

- New innovative prefabricated timber systems for multi-storey construction presentation for EG Property Group – Lunch and Learn session, August 2012, Sydney, Australia
- A case study on construction market needs and expectations for new timber based approaches, presentation for the Forest and Wood Products Australia (FWPA), MADAG group. January 2012 Melbourne, Australia

Reports

- Smith, T., Holmes, M. & Carradine, D. 2012, *A Full Construction, Deconstruction and Reconstruction cycle Cost and Construction analysis of the STIC test building*, Structural Timber Innovation Company (STIC), Christchurch, New Zealand

Posters

- Holmes, M., Crews, K & Ding, G., 2012 Supply Chain Management strategies for prefabricated timber systems in multi-storey non-residential construction, presented to World Conference Timber Engineering (WCTE) 2012, Auckland, New Zealand

Abstract

There is currently limited market penetration for prefabricated timber structural systems in non-residential multi-storey construction in Australia and New Zealand. This limited penetration is caused in part by a fragmented supply chain. There is a need for manufacturers, fabricators and designers to align themselves to better meet the needs and expectations of the non-residential construction environment. There is limited literature available on the impact of the supply chain on other Engineered-To-Order (ETO) products and there is a gap in knowledge on how the supply chain impacts on the performance of prefabricated timber systems. The manufacturer in the prefabricated timber supply chain is the key figure preventing the entire supply chain being structured to better meet the needs of the end user. The prefabricated timber construction supply chain is not structured with the end user in mind, thus decreasing its value. The prefabricated timber supply chain in its entirety should be structured for the non-residential market to better suit the needs of the customer rather than the supplier. Structural contingency theory outlines there should be a fit between the organisational processes and the environment. It states that company models that match the environmental requirements should perform more successfully than those that do not. When applying structural contingency theory to the supply chain the individual dimensions of supply chain should be aligned in order to achieve the best performance.

Case studies interviews were undertaken with industry practitioners and senior leaders from organisations along the supply chain for prefabricated timber systems in Australia, New Zealand (NZ), United Kingdom (UK), Austria, Germany and Finland. These were undertaken to establish how and why the supply chain and organisations along it impact on the performance of prefabricated timber systems. These interviews together with current state-of-the-art of literature formed the basis of the preliminary supply chain model. Building case studies were then undertaken to further clarify these issues and test structural contingency theory, with the supply chain as the environment, the theory was tested using prefabricated timber systems.